Promoting Anti-Racism and Interculturalism in Education

-- Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan
Chapter 1.

Towards a National Action Plan Against Racism

1. Introduction

1.1. Background

The term interculturalism denotes acceptance not only of the principles of equality of rights, values and abilities, but also of the development of policies to promote interaction, collaboration and exchange with people of different cultures, ethnicity or religion. It refers to a recognition of gender issues, and addressing the challenges and barriers that many minority groups such as Travellers, people with disabilities, older adults, and people in disadvantaged areas may face. These groups have distinct needs and cultural patterns which must be respected and reflected in an educational context, and in a systemic and inclusive way which caters for diversity as the norm. While accepting the broad equality context in which interculturalism applies, the focus of this report is mainly on issues of ethnicity and Traveller inclusion. Nevertheless, the recommendations and approaches have application to the overall achievement of social inclusion and equality for many areas and target groups across the education system.

The Irish Government made a commitment to prepare and implement a National Action Plan Against Racism (NPAR) following the World Conference Against Racism held in Durban, South Africa in September 2001. The Department of Education and Science, launched a national consultation on anti-racism and interculturalism in response to this commitment in July 2002. This work in the education sector is also an important part of the National Anti-Poverty Strategy. Designed to be far-reaching, all levels of education are considered including: pre-school, primary, second level, further education/adult learning, higher education and youth/community work. Commissioned by the Department, the City of Dublin VEC Curriculum Development Unit is undertaking this consultation.

Consisting of three phases, the consultation involves:

• National press advertisements seeking submissions,
• oral hearings
• a national conference on 27 November 2002 to consider the reports from the consultation process and the draft recommendations.

Submissions were received from statutory agencies, non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and individuals involved in education. Six oral hearings were organised in Dublin, together with three regional sessions, two in Cork and one in Galway. Discussions focused on points made in submissions and issues previously not addressed. The consultation was initiated to seek submissions from interested parties outlining views and recommendations on promoting anti-racism, as well as interculturalism in education. Contributors were invited to comment on

• Policy and planning for cultural diversity
• Teaching and learning
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

- Organisational practice and structures
- Integration of anti-racism and interculturalism across the curriculum
- Pre-service and in-service staff development
- Resources/support/development of materials
- Relationships with the wider community
- Employment supports, where appropriate, within the educational sector
- Monitoring and reporting mechanisms

The Department was also eager for ideas on partnership actions, reporting mechanisms and integrating anti-racism and interculturalism across the curriculum.

The Department established an anti-racism and intercultural steering committee to advise/support this project and to decide on the content of the education input to the broader National Action Plan against Racism. The Committee includes representatives from:

- Reception and Integration Agency – Chairperson Breda Naughton
- Curriculum Development Unit of Dublin City VEC -- Aidan Clifford, Geraldine Horgan, Marie Moreau and Mary Gannon
- Further Education Development Unit, D/Education and Science -- Mary Kett
- Further Education Section, D/Education and Science -- Margaret Kelly
- Inspectorate, D/Education and Science - Audrey Scott
- Irish Traveller Movement -- Aodh O’Connor
- Irish Vocational Education Association -- Luke Murtagh
- National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI) -- Philip Watt and Catherine Lynch
- National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) -- Majella O’Shea
- Equality Authority – Vincent Edwards
- D/Justice Equality and Law Reform – Terry Jennings

1.2 Outline of report

This Report is in 5 sections. Chapter 1 sets out the background and approach to the consultancy. Chapter 2 presents the context and legal framework for anti-racism, intercultural and equality policies. Chapter 3 sets out a range of developments under way across the education system in this area. Chapter 4 sets out the issues raised in the consultation process, and Chapter 5 presents draft recommendations for discussion.

1.3 Demographic context

Ireland’s birth rate reached its peak in 1980 and there was a dramatic reduction in the number of births per year subsequently, resulting in major change in enrolments across primary and second level school in the years after that. In 1998 the number of 18 year olds was c 74,000.
By 2012 this is expected to reduce to c47,000. Against this backdrop and a declining population of highly educated school leavers entering the labour market, skill and labour shortages have emerged in the Irish economy, which are being filled by returning emigrants, mobility within the EU and a large growth in the numbers with work permits from third countries. In the 1990s Ireland moved from being a country of net emigration to a centre of net immigration.

Cultural diversity is a long-standing though little attended-to characteristic of Irish society. It includes established communities of Travellers, Jewish, Chinese, Italian and Muslim communities, together with other ethnic groups. Of the overall increase in inward migration to Ireland in recent years, only 10% are asylum seekers. Almost half of all recent migrants to Ireland are returning Irish emigrants. Most of the remainder are migrant workers who have been invited and encouraged to work in Ireland as a consequence of skill and labour shortages. The needs of these immigrants are multifarious and require urgent responses but their situation does not comprise the frame within which anti-racist intercultural education policy and codes of practice should be developed.

Trends in Ireland are following international patterns: even if there were no displaced persons fleeing war and persecution, society is becoming more mobile and ethnically diverse (refer to Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform, 2002 for migratory context). This has implications for the education of indigenous majority and minority groups as well as of immigrants.

1.4 Attitudes

Incidents of anti-semitism, relations between settled society and Travellers (the largest minority ethnic group in the country), and the North-South divide -- all point to historic and ongoing societal difficulty with the idea of religious and social diversity. The EU survey, the ‘Eurobarometer’ (2001) shows that there is a degree of suspicion in Irish society towards ethnic diversity. These baseline attitudes require an educational response, to promote acceptance of this rapid social change, a climate of respect for the rights of all, and a welcome for ethnic diversity.
Chapter 2.

The Context

2.1 Principles
Informed by legal and policy instruments, the overall approach adopted in this document is based on a human rights, democracy and equality framework. Development and intercultural education perspectives also inform the approach. Acknowledging the link between local and global issues, a development education perspective facilitates the understanding of the root causes of racism and prejudice.

Intercultural education requires the learner to think critically and engage in a process of questioning and debate to develop an understanding of the complex issues of racism to bring about change for a more inclusive society.

The principles of non-discrimination and equality, access to free primary and post-primary education, positive measures, data collecting and respect for minority cultures/languages are well protected in international law.

2.2 The international context.

2.2.1 The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights was signed by Ireland on the 1 October 1973 and ratified on 8 December 1989. The Human Rights Committee (HRC) on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights monitors the implementation of the Covenant. The right to education is provided in Article 13:

“...education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity, and shall strengthen the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms... education shall enable all persons to participate effectively in a free society, promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups.”

The principles of ‘non-discrimination’ and equal treatment are enshrined in Article 2 (2) of the Covenant. The underpinning belief is that positive action and specialised activities can achieve de facto equality for men, women and disadvantaged groups. However, state parties must closely monitor all relevant policies in education, including institutions, programmes, spending patterns and other practices – to identify and take measures to address discrimination.

Furthermore, it is recommended educational data is disaggregated so that access, participation and outcomes for specific groups can be monitored.

2.2.2 Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989
The Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989 was ratified by Ireland in 1992 and is monitored by an international committee. Monitored by the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, periodic reports are submitted from signatory states.
Incorporating the principle of non-discrimination, the Convention provides that all children and young people under the age of 18 are treated equally within the State “irrespective of the child’s or his or her parents or legal guardian’s race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national, ethnic or social origin, property, disability, birth or other status”.

The Convention provides that states should progressively realise free compulsory primary education and the various forms of second level education ensuring education should be framed by a human rights approach..

2.2.3 The Human Rights Committee on Economic Social and Cultural Rights (1999 and 2002) and the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child (1998) have both been critical of the disparity of access to education in Ireland, particularly with respect to the Traveller community, children from difficult socio-economic backgrounds, children with special needs and refugee children. The issue of adult access to learning for people with disabilities was also raised. Positive action to combat discrimination for these groups based on a rights approach has been advocated.

2.2.4 The European Conference Against Racism

In October 2000, the European Council hosted the European Preparatory Conference Against Racism in preparation for the World Conference on Racism in Durban. Attended by 41 member states, the Council of Europe, European Union and United Nations bodies also participated. Recommendations were made to address issues of racism, xenophobia in Europe.

The General Conclusions of the Inter-governmental Conference recommends particular actions and strategies to be undertaken by participating states, for example:

- Full implementation of international legal instruments
- Anti-discrimination legislation at national level and effective remedies to reinforce protection against racism
- The collection and publication of accurate data
- The development of anti-discrimination monitoring services and the monitoring of outcomes.
- The integration of a gender perspective in policies and practices developed.
- Recognition of the key role of politicians, political parties and the judicial system in promoting anti-racism and respect for cultural diversity
- Equal access to intercultural education
- Training, public awareness campaigns and the strengthening of co-operation with NGOs
- The development of action plans and strategies to include mainstreaming the fight against racism

2.2.5. The World Conference Against Racism

The World Conference Against Racism was held in Durban South Africa in September 2001. Following the conference, the Irish Government made a commitment to prepare and implement...
a National Action Plan against Racism, and this process has been put in train through the Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform. It is intended that the work undertaken through the consultation process in the education sector will feed in the education component to the overall National Plan.

2.3 **The Irish context: Current law, policy and practice**

2.3.1 The Employment Equality Act, 1998 prohibits discrimination in relation to employment on nine distinct grounds:

- Gender
- Marital status
- Family status
- Sexual orientation
- Religion
- Age
- Disability
- Race
- Membership of the Traveller Community

All aspects of employment are included. The legislation applies to public and private sector employment, employment agencies, vocational training bodies, the publication of advertisements, trade unions and professional bodies, full-time/part-time workers and collective agreements.

This legislation established the Office of the Director of Equality Investigations, a quasi-judicial body which appoints Equality officers to hear and decide claims of discrimination in employment under equality legislation.

2.3.2 **Equal Status Act, 2000**

The Equal Status Act, 2000, prohibits discrimination in the provision of goods, services, disposal of property and access to education, on any of the nine grounds referred to under the Employment Equality Act 1998. The Act prohibits discrimination (subject to certain exceptions) in all public and private services generally available to the public. These include: public state services, provision of accommodation, educational establishments and registered clubs.

The Government established the Equality Authority to oversee the implementation of the Equal Status Act. The Equality Authority has statutory powers and responsible for overseeing and monitoring legislation, including the Employment Equality Act, 1998 and the Equal Status Act, 2000. Moreover, the Equality Authority has a public information role, is responsible for mainstreaming equality and initiating equality actions throughout the state.

Provisions within the Equal Status Act, 2000 cover every conceivable type of educational institution. While there are certain exemptions, the basic premise is that educational institutions should not discriminate in four respects –

- admission,
- access,
- terms or conditions, and
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

- expulsion.

### 2.3.3 The Education Act, 1998

The Education Act, 1998 was enacted to:

> "make provision... for the education of every person in the state, including any person with a disability or ... other special need, and to provide generally for primary, post-primary, adult and continuing education and vocational education and training; to ensure that the education system is accountable to students, their parents and the state for the education provided, respects the diversity of values, beliefs, languages and traditions in Irish society...".

In specific Sections of the Act the term ‘diversity’ is applied to the established ethos and traditions of (denominational) schools, and the place of Irish and English languages in the school system. However, ‘diversity’ within the Act is not restricted by an explicit definition, and in the light of other policies and the equality legislation, the understanding of the term can be broadened.

### 2.3.3 Education (Welfare) Act, 2000

Schools are also obliged under the terms of the Education Welfare Act, 2000 to have written codes of practice, to be shown to parents when enrolling their children. These must honour the provisions of the Equal Status Act, 2000 as they apply to schools. This provides an education-specific legal basis for anti-racism, inclusionary policies and codes of practice.

### 2.4 Policy framework for education

#### 2.4.1 National Children’s Strategy, Our Children – Their Lives

The National Children’s Strategy (2000) includes a key objective to ensure that "children will be educated and supported to value social and cultural diversity so that all children including Travellers and other marginalised groups achieve their full potential" (p. 70).

It recommends these following principles inform provision:

- A whole school approach to interculturalism and anti-racism
- Ethnic, cultural and linguistic diversity to be recognised in all policy and service delivery
- English language tuition for children whose mother tongues are other than English
- Provision for unaccompanied children, to be in line with best international practice.
- The implementation of the recommendations of the Task Force Report on Travellers


The White Paper on Education (1995) highlighted concerns about a resurgence of racism and xenophobia "which serve to underline the importance of education in areas such as human rights, tolerance and respect/understanding for cultural identity" (page 203-4).
Promoting Anti-racism and Interculturalism in Education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

The Report of the Forum for Early Childhood Education (1998) supports "the call for intercultural dimensions in teacher education courses. It argues that "Textbooks and teaching materials should respect the diversity of ethnic and cultural images. Attention is also paid to the needs of the young children of immigrants whose home language is not English. The early years are critical to language development on which so much subsequent educational attainment depends. (Forum Secretariat, Coolahan, J. (Ed.) Report of the National Forum for Early Childhood Education, p. 143)

The White Paper on Early Childhood Education, 1999, reiterates the need for consultations with Traveller organisations on a range of issues affecting pre-school provision for Travellers, but does not contain any explicit commitment to incorporate anti-bias, anti-racism or respect for diversity into early childhood education.

The White Paper on Adult Education 2000 sets out 3 principles which should underpin policy and practice in adult education: (1) Lifelong learning as a systemic approach, (2) Equality and (3) Interculturalism. The Paper reiterates a commitment to promote "equality of access, participation and outcome for participants in adult education, with pro-active strategies to counteract barriers arising from differences of socio-economic status, gender, ethnicity and disability."

The White Paper defines interculturalism as:

"... the need to frame educational policy and practice in the context of serving a diverse population as opposed to a uniform one, and the development of curricula, materials, training and in-service, modes of assessment and delivery methods which accept such diversity as the norm. This refers not only to combating racism and encouraging participation of immigrants, refugees and asylum seekers in education, but also to a recognition that many minority groups such as Travellers, people with disabilities, older adults, participants in disadvantaged areas may have distinct needs and cultural patterns which must be respected and reflected in an educational context. It also envisages a more active role by adult educators in the promotion of Irish language and culture" (DES, 2000: 13).

Taking diversity as the norm, the White Paper acknowledges some special needs groups have difficulties negotiating the education system and recognises the immense challenge this poses to education in terms of: modes of teacher selection and training, language, modes of interaction and nature of inter-relationships between tutor and the learner, curricula, course materials and extra-curricula activities. The White Paper proposes marginalized groups should be able to influence and shape policy.


The Task Force Report (1995) contains a number of relevant sections with respect to anti-racism in its sections on Culture, Discrimination, and Education which offer comprehensive and solid reviews of anti-racism and intercultural theory and practice in relation to Travellers. In particular the Report recommends that anti-racism and intercultural curricula should be implemented, and that this ethos should underpin policy and practice; the establishment of a Traveller Education Unit within the Department to implement a co-ordinated strategy; greater dialogue with Traveller organisations; the importance of Traveller role models as staff within the system, the need for positive action and enhanced supports, greater movement towards...
integration rather than special classes, and systematic monitoring and review in partnership with the Traveller community. These recommendations have application to all minority groups, and to inclusionary anti-racist education for both majority and minority students.

The Monitoring Committee Report was critical of the pace of progress in this area, and urged speedier implementation of the Task Force recommendations. Traveller groups (including the Department Advisory Committee on Traveller Education ACTE, the Irish Traveller Movement, Pavee Point, and the National Traveller Women’s Forum) have called for a Traveller Education Strategy to be implemented and a similar monitoring group to guide provision for all minorities.
Chapter 3.
Developments under way

3.1 This Chapter sets out details of some of the major initiatives under way in the education sector. A complete audit has not been undertaken, and there are many other initiatives under way in the system which it has not been feasible to document at this stage.

3.2 Department of Education and Science guidelines on education for minorities

The DES has published two separate booklets incorporating principles of anti-racist and intercultural education for minorities: (1) Information booklet for schools on ASYLUM SEEKERS (2001) and (2) Guidelines on Traveller Education for Primary Schools (2002) and Guidelines on Traveller Education in Second Level Schools (2002).

The information booklet on provision for asylum seekers and other non-national children offers a very brief background and outlines existing supports available to educational institutions. While intercultural education values are mentioned, there is a need for further amplification considering international best practice.

The Traveller education guidelines are more comprehensive and support specific actions. For example, the documents refer to education and enrolment, school planning, retention, validation of Traveller culture, best practice and national support.

3.2 Curricula

Education can play a key role in promoting a respect for personal dignity and that of others, positive attitudes towards other cultures and ethnic groups, a commitment to the democratic process, and an awareness of the rights and responsibilities of citizenship. The curriculum at both primary and post primary level has undergone extensive provision in recent years, and at primary level a new curriculum is being phased in over a 5 year period. The new curricula provide for ample opportunity to extend children’s awareness of their environment and the wider world, to learn about the lives of people in other countries, and of their contribution to art, history, music, drama etc. The Social Personal and Health Education aspects of the curriculum are designed to foster a respect for human dignity, tolerance and respect for the values and beliefs of others and a celebration of diversity. In all of these areas there are opportunities to introduce the themes of anti-racism and interculturalism. The new curricula are supported by inservice training, teacher guidelines, and full-time staff development teams.

At post primary level the Civic Social and Political Education programme is designed to prepare students for participatory citizenship, develop the skills of critical appraisal and decision making based on human rights and social responsibilities. The format allows scope for teachers to deal with issues such as gender equity, racism and xenophobia, interculturalism,

Development issues etc. Pupils are required to undertake at least two class/group action projects in such areas.

While there are opportunities within subject and programme areas (e.g. English, Arts, Religion, History and Geography, Home Economics, Music and Art and Business Education) to look explicitly at the issue of interculturalism and anti-racism, all subjects can be taught from a perspective which respects and reflects cultural diversity.

The Leaving Certificate Applied programme includes a Social Education Module which provides for contemporary issues and human rights issues to be discussed and promoted. Guidelines have been issued for teachers featuring examples of assignments, resources etc.

The NCCA has initiated work at primary and post-primary level to examine ways in which the existing curriculum can be mediated and adapted to reflect the emergence of an expanding multicultural society. The Council is developing guidelines on good practice for schools in this area. It is planned to have a draft framework ready for consultation at the end of 2002 and detailed guidelines for September 2003.

At Further Education level, a working group has been set up and a consultancy commissioned to develop modules in interculturalism for use across the sector. The study includes a short review of relevant curriculum/assessment materials internationally, development of new modules as needed, compilation of a directory of materials and resources, and recommendations on the next steps in an implementation strategy.

3.3 Publications, Resources and Conferences

3.3.1 The curricula at both primary and second level are supported by full-time Support Services and a national inservice training programme.

3.3.2 Additional teaching and non-pay resources are provided to schools at primary and second level to cater for the needs of pupils for whom English is not the mother tongue. The Reception and Integration Agency (RIA) provides support is placing asylum seeker and refugee children in schools when they live in RIA accommodation centres, and supports schools in the integration of these children.

3.3.3 Funds have also been provide to Integrate Ireland Language Training to provide a support programme for teachers responsible for the English language development of non-English speaking immigrant pupils.

3.3.4 Provision of inservice training for teachers is organised on a regional basis and extensive resource packs in this area have been developed in collaboration with teachers.

3.3.5 The INTO has recently published guidelines on a Whole School Approach to Interculturalism.

3.3.6 The National Consultative Committee on Anti-Racism and Interculturalism has produced a resource pack for schools with the Curriculum Development Unit, designed to give practical help to schools in promoting interculturalism through the Civic Social and Political Education curriculum. This is supplemented by other resources and information packs issued by other bodies, including on the theme of development education. Similar initiatives are in operation in the youth sector.

3.3.7 The National Youth Council of Ireland has issued An Anti-Racism and Equality Pack -- Ireland: All Different All Equal -- for use by schools, youth and community groups.

{PAGE}
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

3.3.8 ASTI has released a publication “Education for All” presenting the outcome of a conference at second level. The TUI, and the Higher Education sector have also had conferences on the themes of access, inclusion and diversity. Trinity College Dublin held a seminar in November 2002 on “Working and Teaching in a Multicultural University.”

3.3.9 Many youth work organisations include elements of inter-culturalism and anti-racism in their ongoing programmes and services. Voluntary Service International operate international programmes and incorporate intercultural learning as a central theme in all their programmes. The Youth Affairs Section is represented on the YARD (Youth Against Racism and Discrimination) Monitoring Committee and the Interim Committee for Traveller Youth Initiative. The participation by young people in EU-funded Youth Programmes (operated on behalf of the Department by Léargas, the Exchange Bureau), provide opportunities to experience different cultures by training or working in other EU Member States.

3.3.10 In Further Education, funds have been provided to Integrate Ireland Language Training for staff development and materials for addressing the literacy and language needs of adult asylum seekers. Programme delivery is provided for in VEC adult literacy schemes to the extent that the Literacy budget allows. A substantial number of these schemes now offer ESOL (English for speakers of other languages) provision. Integrate Ireland Language Training has organised a first series of workshops and are currently reviewing the feedback and approach to delivery before proceeding further. This is complemented by staff development work in cooperation with a UK literacy team expert in ESOL under the Dublin project (see under Research below), and the two initiatives are interlinked.

3.4 Research

3.4.1 Mary Immaculate College of Education in Limerick has undertaken research on interculturalism involving 8 primary schools. A conference to disseminate the findings has recently been held.

3.4.2 The Curriculum Development Unit of City of Dublin VEC is working with 3 post-primary schools to develop a whole school perspective on anti-racism and interculturalism. The initiative is being funded by the European Refugee Fund, Ireland Aid and the D/Education and Science In-Career Development Unit. The project has undertaken research in consultation with teachers, parents, students and support staff in the selected schools. From this schools are developing organically their actions and strategies to meet the challenges, and translating this into revised school policies.

There will be an overview of research findings by the end of the year. The report will present the findings, the range of strategies and actions adopted by schools to meet changing needs, and make recommendations for a national strategy.

3.4.3 At Further Education level, an action research project with a full-time co-ordinator has been put in place in the Dublin area to assess the language and literacy needs of adult asylum seekers in consultation with key interests, to initiate pilot actions and make recommendations on a framework and costings for addressing future needs in this area. The report is due to be published shortly. The National Adult Literacy Agency (NALA) is also examining the issue of addressing adult literacy and language needs, in collaboration with the Dublin project and the Integrate Ireland Language Training Unit. A NALA Working Group has drawn up guidelines for ESOL practitioners in literacy schemes which is due to be published shortly.
3.4.4 Approval has also been given for the employment of 2 educational support staff across the Dublin area, hosted by City of Dublin VEC, to assist with assessment of the educational needs of unaccompanied minors, and ensure brokerage of appropriate educational placements.

3.4.5 University College Dublin is also undertaking research on the needs of minority ethnic students in schools.

3.5 Working Groups

3.5.1 The IVEA has established a working group on educational provision for asylum seekers, refugees and non-nationals. The Group has published 2 reports in 2001 and 2002 respectively, making recommendations for a framework to progress the issue in terms of second level schooling and meeting adult needs.

3.5.2 This group is collaborating with another Working Group which has been set up by the Joint Managerial Body (Learning for Young InterNationals) which is exploring similar issues as they apply to secondary and community and comprehensive schools. Both of these groups are in contact with the Department regarding the implementation of a national framework and support system in this area.
Chapter 4.
Issues raised in the Consultation process

4.1 This chapter presents a synthesis of the key issues raised in the consultation process. It is not possible in the context of this short Report to do justice to the range, comprehensiveness and detail which emerged in this process. Accordingly a summary of the key issues and themes is presented, and details of the main recommendations made by the groups are set out in thematic format in Appendix 1.

4.2 The overall context.
While most of the recent major policy texts on education register the need for recognition of ethnic diversity, substantive treatment of the issue is missing. In all but the White Paper on Adult Education, diversity is conceived as linked to disadvantage and special needs, rather than being conceptualised as the norm. Current policy documents offer the elements of a framework for anti-racist intercultural education. However, they need to be strengthened in the future by locating the concept of diversity as a key organising element and positive factor in the framework for provision for all students/learners.

All of society requires education provision informed by principles of anti-racism and interculturalism, regardless of whether the local population are ethnically diverse or not. Specifically with regard to ethnic minorities, the history and impact of discrimination requires

• national policies and actions built on the principles of quality, equality, and pluralism
• dialogue and partnership with the key interest groups
• effective resourcing of support mechanisms
• monitoring and accountability, supported by effective data gathering, and regular reporting and review in the light of evolving needs.

This requires that all levels and stages of the education process are equality proofed with specific reference to ethnic diversity, and that positive actions are implemented to achieve accessible provision, learner retention and achievement.

The submissions argued that the needs of other marginalised categories, particularly disadvantaged youth and people with disabilities should be recognised. Promotion of anti-racism in an unequal society requires more than transmission of data on minorities, or on racism. Effective anti-racism work requires an equality framework in which all forms of injustice are recognised. However, it was stressed that celebrating minority identities should not be equated with need and crisis. A comprehensive broader conceptual basis was needed to ensure a positive anti-racist intercultural education provision.

‘Minorities within minorities’ require a specific focus. Gender and ethnicity can intersect in women’s experience of multiple discrimination. Minority ethnic youth and children, including Travellers nad people with disabilities also experience intersecting forms of discrimination.
The deaf population and community are one of the largest linguistic minorities in Ireland. It was argued that insufficient attention was paid to deaf culture and Irish Sign Language in mainstream education.

4.3 Ethos

A welcoming education system requires an anti-racist intercultural ethos that challenges exclusion, celebrates difference, and promotes positive inter-ethnic relations. There are non-negotiable human rights values which pose challenges to all cultures, majority as well as minority. Celebrating the real diversity in Irish society requires that majority traditions are not privileged or imposed as ‘normal’ on minorities. All students and learners belong in a diverse Irish, European and global society. Therefore, an anti-racist intercultural ethos is necessary whether or not the local population is ethnically diverse.

This requires whole-organisation commitment to principles of equality and human rights, and to processes that address majority attitudes, values and established practices. This is needed at

- **national level** in terms of a clear policy framework supported by dialogue with interest groups, resourcing of supports, staff training and development, flexible curricula and assessment and data gathering and review

- **at organisational level**, (e.g. trade unions, management bodies, co-ordinating structures) through clear policies and leadership, awareness training for all educational and ancillary staff, representation of interest groups, networking and dissemination of best practice,

- **at school/institution/centre** level supported by clear policies and leadership; information and guidance, curricula, training, teaching methods and organisation systems which provide for diversity as the norm, and through explicit monitoring of access, progress and achievement of specific target groups monitoring of target groups.

The importance of **visible role models employed** within the education system from minority ethnic groups, Traveller and people with disabilities was also stressed.

While a number of submissions stressed the need for minority ethnic learners requiring English Language tuition to be evenly distributed across schools and centres, this needed to be balanced against the principles of parental and learner choice which are features of the Irish system.

A small minority of submissions proposed that Irish heritage and values be taught as the norm, into which all groups would fit. Although very few submissions registered these concerns, they are to be heard frequently in public debate and media coverage, so they warrant specific comment.

Although the ‘content’ reference of these arguments pertain to curriculum, the spirit of them pertains to the overall ethos that informs all facets of an education organisation’s life and work — to the hidden as well as the overt curriculum. Majority group traditions and values - cultural practices, religious traditions and Irish language - must be fully respected if a curriculum is to be truly intercultural. However, while all learners, indigenous and immigrant, need to learn about these traditions and values, this must be accompanied by critical reflection on power relations between majority and minority groups. Also, there are non-negotiable human rights values: these pose challenges to all cultures, majority as well as minority. Celebrating the real
diversity in Irish society also requires that majority traditions are not privileged or imposed as normal’ on minorities.

4.4 Partnership, participation and planning
Submissions called for a focus on partnership and on the participation of those experiencing racism and inequality in the decision making processes. The growing diversity and mobility of the population has implications for identifying present and future learning needs, and for planning provision appropriate to these. To ensure ownership of innovations to promote anti-racist intercultural education, their design and implementation must be process-driven and involve all partners at national and local levels. Key partners are the organisations representing minority ethnic groups including Travellers

This process of dialogue was seen as essential at national, organisational and local school/centre level. It should include statutory and community and voluntary interests, and at school level involve parents, learners, management and staff.

A key role was also seen for education (schools, clubs, and other organisations) in promoting inter-ethnic relations among parent communities.

4.5 Critical barriers to access and participation.
Full access to education involves knowing about the opportunities on offer; getting a place on a programme, being appropriately placed within it, and being empowered to pursue the programme effectively. In many submissions, deep concern was expressed for the situation of asylum seekers and low-paid economic migrants and of other minority ethnic groups in terms of

- **access to employment** -- difficulties with recognition of qualifications, the Irish language requirement in certain instances
- **access to schools, placement and progression within education** -- difficulties with recognition of qualifications, requirement to have a birth certificate, enrolment priority to specific denominations etc.
- **inadequate information** on education opportunities, entitlements, progression routes and supports. These factors were exacerbated by lack of English language skills, low literacy levels, or specific forms of marginalisation
- **access to further and higher education**. In general, refugees and those with humanitarian leave to remain in the State can access further and higher education and are eligible for the student support schemes subject to the usual conditions. Recognition of prior educational qualifications and residency clauses can cause problems for this group. All other non-EU nationals are required to pay the economic fee, with the exceptions that asylum seekers with the right to work can access vocational education and training at Further Education Level. Adult asylum seekers generally, without the right to work, can only access literacy and language supports, which are provided free. These issues were highlighted in the submissions as causing deep concern. This was particularly the case where students were studying and performing well in second school and completing their Leaving Certificate, only to find that progression at the next level was blocked.

**Admission procedures** which fail to recognise other qualifications, **assessment arrangements** which are culturally inappropriate and fail to address language barriers
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

(sometimes resulting in inappropriate placement, and creating further difficulties in reaching the points for third level entry). Lack of relevant and culturally appropriate guidance and information, and lack of facilities for home study were also highlighted.

4.6 English Language tuition

Fluency in language was understood as including both linguistic skill, and knowledge of how to deploy this in various social situations. Key points highlighted in this regard were

• That the English language is central to achievement in all areas of the curriculum, as well as to acquiring the skills and confidence (cultural capital) necessary to engage with Irish society and to enter and successfully engage with further and higher education.

• That current provision of English language tuition for 2 years is not sufficient. Research suggests that 3-5 years of support is required comprising initial induction and supported integration.

• That there is a critical need to address the language needs of adults for whom English is not the mother tongue, regardless of status. Many adult members of minority ethnic groups are caught into a cycle of dependency on social welfare, or are in low-paid unskilled employment. They do not have access to free or affordable ESOL tuition. Language barriers also can result in inappropriate educational or training placements, or being directed towards unskilled work, regardless of qualifications and experience. Addressing the language needs of parents was particularly important. In many families parents may not speak English but their Irish-born children do. This can result in difficulties in interacting with the school, as well as imposing inappropriate adult roles on children who act as translators.

4.7 Curricula

As diversity is increasing in Irish society, curricula for all sectors must reflect the breadth, diversity and ongoing development in cultures worldwide. This challenges the Eurocentric frame within which much of current curricula are set. It requires broadening the curriculum to include exploration of the wide and varied strands of world history, languages, arts, sciences, economies, social and religious traditions and practices. Anti-racism intercultural curricula were seen as applicable at all levels, from pre-school through to third level and professional training. Design and development of all curricula in the formal and non-formal sectors need to be informed by principles of anti-racism and interculturalism. Other key points were that

• Diversity of indigenous Irish traditions also requires fuller representation. Several submissions mentioned that educators need more information on Traveller culture; the same could be said about the traditions of the Jewish, Italian-Irish, and other minority groups.

• In a strongly print-oriented education system, care is needed to respect the predominantly oral heritage of many cultures. For many immigrant groups, respect and support for their mother tongues and community cultures requires involvement of members of those groups in education provision. These elements could be included in programmes leading to certification.

• Development education and international experience in curriculum planning were noted as useful resources to promote rich and substantial policies and programmes, to ensure knowledge and critical awareness of issues of global and local injustice and inequality. In modern society, critical awareness includes development of critical media literacy.
• Inclusion of mother tongue and community culture in education provision were called for.

4.8 Awareness raising, and training in anti-racism and interculturalism

The principles of human rights, equality and interculturalism should inform and be taught in pre-service and ongoing education and training for personnel at all levels of the education system. This applies to teachers, management and ancillary staff, and to educational organisations, management bodies and support services. Awareness raising and challenge to long-held unconscious beliefs should, as a matter of urgency, be built into this provision. Given their expertise and experience in education and awareness raising, non-formal sector/NGO bodies have a substantial contribution to make in developing intercultural and anti-racism training.

National and international networking around these issues is required, by organisations and by groups such as teachers, to ensure dissemination of best practice.

4.9 Support services

Submissions called for minority support teams to deliver appropriate in-career training and education resources to educators, ancillary and support staffs, and offer advice on development of policy, codes of practice, and assessment and delivery issues. These could be similar to the primary and second-level curriculum support services, but it was important they

• be governed by principles of anti-racism and interculturalism and
• Successful in influencing mainstream policy and practice at all levels

Traveller representative organisations have called for a Traveller Education Strategy, and a designated unit in the Department to implement and monitor this strategy. Similar structures to implement and monitor strategy for all minority ethnic groups were called for in submissions.

Specialised staff are also required to support minority ethnic students and learners with specific needs, such as the educational assessment and placement needs of unaccompanied minors.

The need for adequate, appropriate, and readily available teaching and learning resources was highlighted, reflecting modern images of the range of cultures in the Irish population, and including positive portrayals of Travellers. This would ensure relevant and age appropriate anti-racist and intercultural resources for different learning situations. This issue should be highlighted in guidelines provided to educational publishers. ICT and film based resources for intercultural anti-racism programmes were also highlighted as having potential.

Where libraries in schools or other education centres include books in students' mother tongues, it both supports community cultures in themselves and endorses their value within the cultural frame of the organisation.

4.10 Policy and practice

The need for clear policies and frameworks, accompanied by leadership, investment, support, data gathering and monitoring were highlighted at every level of the system, including

• At national level through the Department of Education and Science
• At organisational level, through management, union and co-ordinating bodies
• At local institution/school/centre level. This reflects policy developments in the UK: education institutions must have explicit policy and codes of practice both to prohibit racism, and to promote good inter-ethnic relations.
4.11 Methodology

Anti-racist intercultural education requires experiential learning methodologies to promote appreciation of diversity, mutual understanding, and critical analysis. Such methods include collaborative learning, peer education, and cross-curricular work. However, these methods need to be skilfully used to ensure respect for all perspectives while holding to core principles. They also need to be well resourced in terms of personnel, teaching skills, time, space, and class size and teaching resources.

Given their expertise and experience in awareness raising work, non-formal sector/NGO bodies have a substantial contribution to make in personnel training, curriculum and programme development and delivery, and production of education resource materials. Schools and youth organisations effectively using methods such as peer education in anti-racist intercultural work should be supported, and their expertise disseminated.

Working with students in multilingual classes was found to require new teaching skills, which need to be integrated into courses on teaching methodologies.

Assessments should be a fair test of a student’s knowledge of a subject area, and methods should be developed to support those whose level of attainment in English prevents them from understanding or answering a question adequately. Accommodation at examinations could be expanded to include specific provision to meet the needs of students whose mother tongue is other than English.

4.12 Quality assurance: Evaluation and outcomes

Anti-racism proofing involves the examination of the impact of all education policies and practices on people from minority ethnic groups, and of the attitudes and behaviour of the majority population towards them. It was proposed that organisational audits of educational institutions, or whole school evaluations, would examine the following for implementation of anti-racist intercultural principles:

- Staff and organisational values
- Awareness of race and interculturalism
- The culture of the organisation
- Procedures and practices
- Resources
- Language and images used in the organisation

This needs to be mirrored at centre/school and at organisational and national level by audits of the policies, codes of practice and programmes to ensure they are equality-proofed and promote anti-racism and interculturalism in all their aspects.

In addition, data collection is a key requirement for quality assurance. This would need to include

- monitoring racist incidents with a view to developing strategies to address them
- Data systems which provide disaggregated data on access, participation, performance and outcomes of specific target groups

It was suggested that implementation of equality principles should be linked to funding and resources.
4.13 Research

The need for further research to inform practice was highlighted, building on international experience in this area.
Chapter 5

Draft recommendations

5.1 This chapter sets out the key recommendations of the steering group, based on the issues and themes which have emerged to date. It will be refined and adapted in the light of the feedback from the conference. Appendix 1 attached sets out the main recommendations which were made in the various submissions and focus groups. However, at this stage, a broader approach is considered necessary focusing on the critical strategic issues

5.2 Policy

Future policies must be developed within the context of rights based equality approach, catering for diversity as the norm. This approach needs to be taken account of in the intrinsic design of systems.

The D/Education and Science should develop an over-arching equality strategy which incorporates the core principles of anti-racism and inter-culturalism. This strategy should examine and address equality of access, participation and outcome at every level of the system for Travellers and other ethnic minority groups. The strategy should include

- Specific targets and timescales for implementation
- Investment in training and support systems
- Data gathering, research and dissemination
- Regular review and reporting.

This approach needs to be mirrored at organisational and institutional/school/centre level.

School policies should address equality, recruitment, admission, anti-racism and bullying issues and be accompanied by clear guidelines or codes of practice which are known and implemented by all staff.

5.3 Ethos

An anti-racist intercultural ethos should underpin policy and practice, and be mainstreamed throughout the education system. This approach should ensure that diversity is catered for as the norm, and operate within an equality framework which recognises all forms of disadvantage (for example gender, disability, socio-economic etc) and how they intersect.

5.4 Partnership, participation and planning

Dialogue and partnership are essential to promote effective policies and best practice. This should include

- dialogue at national level with national Traveller and ethnic interest groups and between the statutory and voluntary sectors
- involvement of parent, community and learner interests with staff and management at local level
- pro-actively seeking the representation from minority interest groups in decision-making, consultation and monitoring fora
Network and partnerships, national and international, around these issues to ensure international best practice

Training and support to enable interest groups to engage in these processes.

5.5 Supports

At national level, the Department of Education and Science should provide for a co-ordinated strategy in regard to anti-racism and interculturalism at every level of the system, building on the approach to the establishment of the Social Inclusion Unit.

Support services for schools and centres of education should be developed, building on the curriculum support services, to provide training, guidance, information and support in addressing the needs of Travellers and minority ethnic groups, and to ensure appropriate assessment of needs and placement. These services could include bilingual support staff, classroom assistants, home-school liaison personnel, outreach development workers, equality officers, etc.

Translation services should be available both within the community, and to participants and service providers in education institutions. Information documents should be translated both into represented languages and into communication formats that are accessible to all regardless of literacy levels.

To promote effective participation in education opportunities both for parents and for their children, opportunities to gain fluency in English should be made available to all in the family. English language tuition should be provided to all who need it, irrespective of status. Investment in this area needs to be increased to provide for more intensive tuition options over a longer period.

Barriers to access should be reviewed, particularly in regard to progression to further and higher education, childcare support for adults, and funding barriers for children concerning the costs of school participation.

Targeted supports for school-going youth and children should include homework clubs.

5.6 Awareness raising, and training in anti-racism and interculturalism

Personnel at all levels of the national and local education system (management, educators, support and ancillary personnel) should undertake ongoing awareness raising and training in principles and practice of anti-racism and interculturalism in education.

This should build on best practice internationally, and be incorporated into pre-service and inservice training for teachers. NGOs and educational bodies with expertise in this area should be involved in the process.

5.7 Curricula

Curricula for all levels should promote respect for all groups and traditions in Irish society - those of minorities, including Travellers, and those of the indigenous majority. As diversity is increasing in Irish society, curricula for all sectors should reflect and respect the breadth, diversity and ongoing development in cultures worldwide. To respect the diversity of modes of transmission of cultural heritage, consideration should be given to including oral traditions in the curriculum.

Development of accredited training for teachers of mother tongue and community languages should be considered, and the range of subjects should be expanded over time so that students
are provided with the opportunity to study their community language and literature as a subject for certificate examinations

5.8 Assessment
Examination arrangements for learners for whom English is not the mother tongue should include such flexibility as sanction to use a dictionary, extra time, or oral examinations. The feasibility of sanction to undertake examinations through the medium of their mother tongue should also be examined.

In relation to assessment of learner’s needs, specific expertise and new approaches need to be developed in line with best practice, to ensure that language, qualification and other barriers do not result in inappropriate placements.

5.9 Methodology
Training in experiential methodologies and in their use in the field of anti-racism and intercultural education programmes, should be provided for educators. The role of youth work in promoting an intercultural society, nationally and internationally should be recognised and good practice should be promoted.

Methodologies suited to teaching multilingual classes should be incorporated into teacher training.

5.10 Teaching and learning resources
Teaching and learning materials should be equality-proofed and reflect the cultural diversity of the population.

Libraries in schools and other education organisations should include books in students’ mother tongues.

Time, space, staff and investment must be devoted to promoting effective access, participation and outcomes for learners from minority groups.

Guidance and information services need to be adapted to ensure relevance and appropriateness to the needs of minority groups.

5.11 Quality assurance: research and evaluation
The DES should research examples of best practice elsewhere and also provide opportunities for teachers and educators to visit institutions in Europe with a strong background in this area.

Research should also focus on examining the specific educational needs of ethnic minorities in Ireland.

Data and inspection/evaluation systems must support the monitoring of the educational achievement of minority ethnic groups.

Progress reports on implementation of the strategy should be an inbuilt part of the system.

search
Definitions

Discrimination
Any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference, based on race, colour, descent, national or ethnic origin, which has the purpose of modifying or impairing recognition, the enjoyment or exercise on an equal footing of human rights and fundamental freedom in the political, economic, social, cultural or any field of public life constitutes racial discrimination (UN International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1969).

Racism
Racism is a specific form of discrimination and exclusion faced by minority ethnic groups. Racism is based on the false belief that some ‘races’ are inherently superior to others because of different skin colour, nationality, ethnic or cultural background. Racism deprives people of their basic human rights, dignity and respect. There are different forms of racism and manifests itself at different levels (Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform, 2002).

Institutional racism
The collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate or professional service to people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitude and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness, and racist stereotypes which disadvantage minority ethnic people (MacPherson Report, 1999).

Anti-racism
Anti-racism refers to all strategies that contribute to the elimination of racism in all its forms, interpersonal and institutional.

Interculturalism
…acceptance not only of the principles of equality of rights, values and abilities but also the development of polices to promote interaction, collaboration and exchange with people of different cultures, ethnicity or religion living in the same territory… interculturalism is an approach that can enrich a society and recognises racism as an issue that needs to be tackled in order to create a more inclusive society… (NCCRI, 2002: 6).
Appendix 1.

Recommendations made in the submissions.

1. In future national policy texts, the concept of diversity needs to be located in the core of policy for all students/learners, and to be substantially developed in its application to specific provisions.

2. Regular review of policy is necessary.

3. Policy needs to include schedules for implementation and strategies for monitoring and ensuring implementation.

4. The Advisory Committee on Traveller Education to re-examine the provisions and applications of the Task Force and Monitoring Committee Reports.

5. To ensure the development of comprehensive policy and its implementation, monitoring and review, requires that it be made the responsibility of a designated senior level executive within the Department of Education and Science, supported by a cross-sectoral minorities education Department unit similar to that proposed to develop and oversee a Traveller Education Strategy.

Ethos

6. Anti-racism and interculturalism policy and practice to be mainstreamed throughout the education system, as a core element of all education organisation and provision.

7. Education organisations to provide structured integration and orientation strategies that facilitate majority and minority ethnic groups to identify and reflect on their experience of diversity.

8. Anti-racism principles to be implemented within an equality framework that recognises all forms of injustice (for instance, socio-economic disadvantage) and how they intersect.

Partnership, participation and planning

9. To ensure development of effective anti-racist intercultural education, provision must be process driven, involving partners from the community, the students/learners, and statutory and community sector agencies.

10. All partners need to collaborate in identifying education needs and potential of people from minority ethnic groups, and in identifying and developing appropriate forms of provision.

11. Education services and interest groups must be pro-active in seeking involvement of minority ethnic groups including Travellers in the planning and implementation processes. Strategies to be developed to promote involvement in partnership by women, men, youth and children from all ethnic groups.

12. Networking and partnerships, national and international, around these issues to ensure international best practice.

13. The cultural identity of Irish deaf society and status of Irish Sign language to be recognised in the mainstream education system and programmes.

Education organisations: management, staffing and training

14. To promote professional employment in education by minority ethnic members with qualifications from outside the country, active recruitment and accreditation processes are needed.

15. To promote representation by Travellers and other minority ethnic members who have not had access to higher education, alternative roles need to be developed (for instance as bilingual support staff, classroom assistants, home-school liaison personnel, outreach development workers, equality officers, etc.).

16. A designated person to hold responsibility for integration and education welfare of minority ethnic students. This person to receive appropriate training and resourcing.
17. Units to be established in the Department, similar to the Social Inclusion Business Unit, to implement and monitor education provision in relation to Travellers and to all minority ethnic groups.

**Awareness raising, and training anti-racism and interculturalism**

18. The development and implementation of quality standards in anti-racist, intercultural training and education in accordance with international best practice to be undertaken in consultation with NGOs and other groups with expertise in this area.

19. Personnel at all levels of the national and local education system (management, educators, support and ancillary personnel) to undertake ongoing awareness raising and training in principles and practice of anti-racism and interculturalism in education.

**Policy documents: issues and requirements**

20. **Equality policy:** Policy on recruitment, admissions, codes of practice and programmes to be informed by equality principles and to include explicit reference to minority ethnic groups including Travellers.

21. **Admissions policies** Agreed guidelines on anti-racist policy and codes of practice for admissions, integration, and for monitoring and reviewing these, to be developed nationally by the relevant authorities. National and local policies should explicitly register principles of inclusion and anti-discrimination relating to ethnic identity, religious affiliation, economic status, prior education experience and qualifications, and residency in Ireland.

22. **Anti-racism and anti-bullying policies.** Specific anti-racism policy should be formulated; if this policy is incorporated into anti-bullying policy it should form an explicit subsection. These policies and codes of practice to both prohibit racism and promote positive inter-ethnic relations.

23. Comprehensive guidelines on anti-racism and intercultural education programmes and methodologies, designed to address both minority and majority issues, to be developed, disseminated and implemented at all levels.

**Access and participation**

24. Methods of disseminating information about education opportunities to be diversified, to ensure that the knowledge reaches all sectors of minority groups.

25. Translation services to be available both within the community, and to participants and service providers in education institutions. Information documents to be translated both into represented languages and into communication formats that are accessible to all regardless of literacy levels.

26. Adequate levels of standardised, culturally appropriate assessment procedures, that take account of linguistic diversity, to be developed and resourced.

27. To promote effective participation in education opportunities both for parents and for their children, opportunities to gain fluency in English should be made available to all in the family.

28. Level of education support provision (for instance, travel allowances, costs of books, fees, uniforms etc.) to be made comprehensive and adequate to meet real costs.

29. Targeted supports for women from minority ethnic groups, to include crèche services, culturally appropriate child care facilities and supports.

30. Targeted supports for school-going youth and children to include homework clubs.

31. Welfare personnel in education (counsellors, care workers, home liaison, etc) to be developed so that they provide culturally appropriate personal support and information and access to further opportunities.

32. Admission to education opportunities for people over age 18 to be opened to all, including asylum seekers, refugees and migrant workers.
33. Colleges should consider the allocation of reserved places and financial support for members of minority ethnic groups, similar to the system for mature students;

34. Access courses to be developed and resourced to ensure that students can progress successfully through further and higher education courses.

Curriculum

English language tuition

35. English Language Tuition to be provided to all who need it, regardless of place of birth.

36. ELT services to be further resourced and developed, to ensure that students gain effective mastery of English for academic and social life.

37. Specialist training EAL support teachers to be developed to best international standards and extended to all in these positions.

38. Language tuition to include tuition in technical terminology for subjects such as Science.

39. ESOL programmes and teaching materials to take account of learners’ prior skills, experience, needs and aspirations.

40. Opportunities for ESOL tuition to be developed suited to the social/work situations of adult members of minority ethnic groups.

41. Linkages between ESOL providers and the employer sector to be developed, to devise and implement ESOL programmes for the workplace.

Curricula

42. Curricula for all levels should promote respect for all groups and traditions in Irish society - those of minorities, including Travellers, and those of the indigenous majority.

43. To respect the diversity of modes of transmission of cultural heritage, oral traditions to be given a place in the curriculum.

44. Development of accredited training for teachers of mother tongue and community languages is required.

45. Anti-racism and interculturalism principles should be integrated into and consistent across all curriculum areas; to promote effective implementation of these principles, their integration is particularly necessary in initial and in-career professional education and training.

46. Cross-curricular treatments, as well as specific modules on anti-racism and interculturalism to be developed for all levels.

47. A comprehensive media literacy dimension must be included in all anti-racism programmes.

48. Development education principles need to be integrated into all curriculum areas.

49. Students be provided with the opportunity to study their community language and literature as a subject for certificate examinations.

Methodology

50. The current structures of education provision to be reviewed with a view to freeing up and augmenting the staffing levels, time, space and other resources needed to promote experiential education methods.

51. Training in experiential methodologies and in their use in the field of anti-racism and intercultural education programmes, to be provided for educators.

52. Organisations and projects that have developed effective methodologies should be supported and the good practice disseminated.
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

53. The role of youth work in promoting a multicultural society, nationally and internationally, to be recognised and promoted.

54. Methodologies suited to teaching multilingual classes to be incorporated into teacher training.

Teaching and learning resources

55. Intercultural curricula and teaching materials must be equality-proofed and reflect the cultural diversity of the population.

56. Teaching and learning materials to be assessed for relevance to all students, for their power to promote diverse identities, histories and experiences.

57. Libraries in schools and other education organisations should include books in students' mother tongues.

58. In keeping with the principle of partnership, teaching and learning materials to be developed with active involvement by minority groups

Quality assurance: Evaluation and outcomes

59. The educational achievement of minority ethnic groups children to be monitored, to assess progress and to provide targeted support for all who are not reaching their expected goals.

60. Accommodations for examinations to include sanction to use a dictionary for instance, extra time, oral examinations, and sanction to undertake examinations through the medium of their mother tongue.

61. Current training programme should be evaluated, kept in line with best practice and fully supported by the DES.

Research

62. The DES should research examples of best practice elsewhere and also provide opportunities for teachers and educators to visit institutions in Europe with a strong background in this area.

63. Research is required to assess the impact of current policies and to identify appropriate ways forward.

64. The voice of ‘the researched’ to be registered: partnership in design, conduct of research, and in evaluation of outcomes and applications to be promoted.
Appendix 2

CDVEC Curriculum Development Unit: Consulting organisation

The CDVEC Curriculum Development Unit is a curriculum research and development institute. Established in 1972, the Unit is managed by a committee with representatives from Trinity College Dublin, the Department of Education and Science and the City of Dublin Vocational Education Committee (CDVEC). Activities within the Unit apply a development education, equality, human rights and social justice dimension to education work. Over the years the Unit has initiated many innovative projects (national and international) and currently hosts a range of national support services. Aidan Clifford is acting director of the Unit and represents the Department of Education and Science in the Council of Europe.

Set up in 2000, the Unit’s Interculturalism Project published *Changing Perspectives: Cultural Values, Diversity, Equality in Ireland and the Wider World*, (Gannon, 2002) to support the Civil, Social and Political Education programme in schools. In January 2002, it initiated another project to support schools in formulating policies of inclusion and interculturalism entitled: *A Whole School Approach to Interculturalism and Inclusion*.

The Consultancy Team Co-ordinator: Geraldine Horgan

Geraldine Horgan is a teacher employed by the Co. Meath VEC with particular experience in development education.

Rachel Doyle:

Community development worker and facilitator. Rachel is the Irish representative on the European Network Against Racism.

Mary Gannon: Consultant adviser

Mary Gannon has produced 2 teacher resources for the Civic, Social and Political Education programme and is currently completing a PhD on *Responses to Cultural Diversity: Issues for Irish Post-Primary Education*. She is the adviser to the Curriculum Development Unit’s project *A Whole School Approach to Interculturalism and Inclusion*.

Maírín Kenny: Consultant researcher

Maírín Kenny is the author of *The Routes of Resistance: Travellers and Second level Schooling* (Ashgate Publishing, 1997). Recent research includes studies of education provision and people with disabilities, Travellers and education, and ongoing work on issues relating to ethnicity and racism in schools.

Marie Moreau: Consultant adviser

Intercultural Officer, CDU

Marie Moreau has worked in education for many years, as a primary teacher in Ireland and at second and third level in Lesotho. Marie is the Co-ordinator of the Interculturalism Project *A Whole School Approach to Interculturalism and Inclusion* in the CDU.

Tanya Ward: Consultant researcher

Asylum Seeker Research and Development Officer, City of Dublin VEC

Tanya Ward has been employed with the CDVEC since November 2000 and has researched and written several reports, including: *Immigration and Residency in Ireland* (2001) and *Asylum Seekers in Adult Education: A Study of Language and Literacy Needs* (2002). Tanya is currently writing a report on the education needs of separated children.
Appendix 3: List of submissions received

The following organisation made written submissions

Amnesty International
Aontas
Arts Resources and Training Services
Centre for Early Childhood Development and Education, St. Pat’s College, D.9
Church of Scientology
City of Dublin Youth Service Board
Comhlamh and A part of Ireland Now
Film Institute of Ireland
Galway City and County Childcare Community
Galway consultative group including: Galway Refugee Support Group; Galway City Partnership; Galway School Project; National Parents' Council Ireland- primary; Presentation Primary School; Scoil Bríde National School, Language Support Teachers and other formal sector teachers.
IBBY Ireland
INTO
Ireland Distance Learning Ltd
Irish Association of Teachers in Special Education
Methodist Board of Education
National Adult Literacy Strategy
National Congress of Catholic Secondary School Parents
National Centre for Guidance in Education
National Committee for Development Education
National Lesbian and Gay Federation
Nigeria Support Group
Paul Partnership
Pavee Point Travellers Centre
Presentation Education Office, Northern Province
Presentation Education Office, S.E. Province
South Kerry Development Partnership Ltd.
Swords Educate Together
The Children's Research Centre, TCD.
Trocair
YARD- The National Youth Council of Ireland.
Irish Vocational Education Association

{PAGE}
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

National Parents' Council - Primary
Ruharna
LYNS - a joint initiative of the Joint Managerial Body and the Association of Community and Comprehensive Schools.

Individuals:
Mr Aidan McCardle
Mr Matthew O'Connor Jnr
Mr R J Hitchings
Dr Padraig Hogan
Ms Eva Boyle
Ms Helen Keogh
Appendix 4: List of Legal Instruments

International


European instruments

? The European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 1950

National instruments

? Constitution of Ireland, 1937

? Education Act, 1998


? Equal Status Act, 2000
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan

References

E/C.12/I/Ad.35. (Concluding Observations/Comments.


{PAGE }
Promoting Anti-racism and interculturalism in education: Draft recommendations towards a National Action Plan


This section will outline elements in DES policy documents that address issues of quality, equality, pluralism, partnership an